DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 418 200 UD 032 260

AUTHOR	Straub, Alicia, Comp.
TITLE	School Choice Annotated Bibliography.
PUB DATE	1997-08-00
NOTE	30p.
PUB TYPE	Reference Materials - Bibliographies (131)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Annotated Bibliographies; *Charter Schools; Citations (References); Educational Change; *Educational Vouchers; Elementary Secondary Education; Foreign Countries; *Free Choice Transfer Programs; Literature Reviews; Magnet Schools; *Nontraditional Education; Research Reports; *School Choice; School Restructuring; Urban Schools
IDENTIFIERS	United Kingdom; United States

ABSTRACT

This annotated bibliography of articles and books related to school choice contains 94 annotations. Included are research reviews, case studies, analyses of policy and practice, collections of studies and articles, reports on research conducted in particular school districts, and arguments in support of and against school choice. Various forms of choice are discussed, including voucher systems, magnet schools, open enrollment programs, inter-district choice programs, and charter schools. Many of the articles and books focus on urban schools and the importance of school choice for disadvantaged children. Although the focus is on the United States, several works discuss school choice in the United Kingdom. (SLD)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ALICIA STRAUB, Compiler

SCHOOL CHOICE ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

ED 418 200

Ambler, J.S. 1994. "Who Benefits from Educational Choice? Some Evidence From Europe." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 13, no. 3, pp. 454-76.

In this article, evidence from Britain, France, and The Netherlands is examined to test the claim that educational choice enhances equality of opportunity by empowering parents of modest income. The author concludes that the European experience clearly suggests that, whatever its merits in other respects, educational choice tends to intensify class segregation through the effects of different preferences and information costs. Various means of moderating these effects are considered.

Amor, D.J. and Peiser, B.M. 1997. *Competition in Education: a case study of interdistrict choice.* Boston: Pioneer Institute for Public Policy Research.

This final report of a study conducted by Amor and Peiser on the Massachusetts interdistrict choice program focuses on the program's effects on racial balance and financial impacts. Based on case studies of 20 school districts, state data, and original survey data, the researchers found that the program had no significant effect on racial balance or on the financial health of sending districts, the market competition thesis is valid for the Massachusetts interdistrict choice program, and that the program positively effects motivation of parents and students.

Arons, Stephen. 1971. "Equity, Option, and Vouchers." *Teachers College Record*, 72, no. 3, (February): 337-63.

In the article, the author discusses education vouchers as a structural reform being demanded by a variety of groups in response to the gap between the promise of public schooling and its performance- a gap which has grown to proportions which prompt sensible people, he says, to wonder whether we are not using the wrong political system altogether for the governance and provision of public education. He goes on to say that the common school promised to be a melting pot wherein all have an equal opportunity to gain the prerequisites of a fruitful life; but the evidence increases that not only do the schools discriminate against the poor, the black, the Indians, the Chicanos, the sensitive, and the creative, but they have never significantly helped any minority group. He explores whether vouchers will be an improvement by analyzing a series of issues- economic models, admissions policies, accountability, the range of alternatives, and church-state separation. His attempt is to point out some of the value decisions which are imbedded in each major issue.

Arum, Richard. 1996. "Do Private Schools Force Public Schools to Compete?" *American Sociological Review*, 61, (February): 29-46.

In this article, the author demonstrates that public school students in states with large private school sectors have improved educational outcomes using state-level data on the size of the private school sector, public school

UD032260

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

student/teacher ratios, income per student, and percent urban. Contrary to assumptions underlying the school-choice movement, however, this author found that the improved performance of public school students is not the result of increased organizational efficiency, but instead is the product of increased resources provided to public schools. He concludes that the state thus takes an active role in protecting public sector providers and that institutional forces are less salient predictors of organizational behavior than are dynamic political processes.

Astin, Alexander W. 1992. "Educational 'Choice': Its Appeal May Be Illusory." *Exchange*, (October): 255-60.

In this article the author uses examples from the business world to argue that one highly likely consequence of implementing a policy of choice would be to magnify the existing social stratification of the schools. In addition, he argues that it will encourage more middle-class parents to send their children to private schools who will respond by becoming more selective, rather than expanding their enrollments. He concludes that the public deserves a full airing of these important issues before any final decision about choice is made.

Bastian, Ann. 1990. "School Choice: Unwrapping the Package." In *Choice in Education*, Boyd, W.L. and Walberg, H.J., eds. Berkeley: McCutchan, 177-186.

In this article the author argues that school choice has become the principal focus of efforts to restructure schools, and therefore gives educators and reformers reason to clarify the specific pros and cons of choice. Using examples from New York City and Minnesota, she demonstrates how choice can be both promising and damaging. She suggests that to assess whether a choice plan will benefit, distract, or damage a school program, parents and educators should look closely at how the plan is constructed and how well it suits the specific circumstances of the local school community. Finally she considers the negative impact that choice will have on equal opportunity, accountability, and the democratic governance of schools and concludes that she cannot applaud any educational system that structures achievement in terms of winners and losers, whether it be a school or the students in it.

Bastian, Ann. 1992. "Which Choice? Whose Choice?" *The Clearing House*, 66, no. 2, (November/December): 96-99.

In this article, the author presents a review of three kinds of school choice models: 1) local "controlled-choice" 2) interdistrict and statewide public school plans and 3) voucher plans. Using common examples of each kind of choice plan from such places as East Harlem, New York, Minnesota, and Milwaukee, she concludes that there is nothing inherent in choice that fixes what is really wrong with schools, and that there is no short cut to building good schools.

Bierlein, Louann A. et al. 1993. *A National Review of Open Enrollment/Choice: Debates and Descriptions*. Tempe: Morrison Institute for Public Policy, Arizona State University.

This report examines the issue of educational choice in detail, beginning with a historical review and concluding with a look at the future of choice in the United States. Focusing on both opposing and supporting sides of the debate, this report examines equity issues, including access to information, adequate and appropriate transportation, fair and objective admission criteria, and segregation issues. Finance issues, such as the costs of including private schools, local funding concerns, and the notion of a flawed rewards-and-sanctions system, are reviewed. Common school and constitutional issues, the supremacy of private schools, and debates surrounding the bureaucratic entrenchment of public education are also highlighted. Information from experts and examples of actual programs are provided for each issue. School-choice programs have demonstrated continued program growth, few dramatic effects, and general parental satisfaction. Regarding the future of school choice, the question appears to be shifting away from "Should there be choice at all?" toward "What kind of choice is appropriate?"

Appendices contain a national review of the status of open enrollment/choice programs during 1993, a description of formal choice programs in 14 states, and descriptions of programs in 12 states with limited formal legislation or legislation considered in 1993.

Bierlien, Louann A. 1996. *Charter Schools: Initial Findings*. Denver: Education Commission of the States, (March).

This report attempts to give a clearer picture of the types of charter schools that are being created and the children they are serving. It addresses the questions: what do we know about charter schools? and what impacts are charter schools having? Also provides an analysis of the 20 initial charter school laws.

Biller, Lowell W. 1995. "School Choice: An Educational Myth or a Panacea?" *NASSP Bulletin*, (September): 33-40.

In this article, the author asserts that while the school choice movement offers real advantages in producing a market-driven, competitive, performance-based system, it is not an educational panacea. Many fundamental changes must occur before long-term benefits will result.

Blank, Rolf K. 1990. "Educational Effects of Magnet High Schools." In Clune, W.H. and Witte, J.F., eds. *Choice and Control in American Education*. New York: Falmer Press.

Block, H.M. 1996. "Constraints on School Supply Under School-Choice Programs: A study of charter schools." Ph.D. thesis, Stanford University. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 57, no. 8, pg. 3331.

This study investigated how constraints on supply are a function of school-choice legislation and therefore, in turn, how supply-side constraints explain variation in the number of charter schools across the states. Eleven charter school bills were analyzed, and data was also collected via discussion with charter school officials and experts, and an extensive review of state documentation. A primary strategy employed innovative measurement of

entry barriers to ascertain the impact of barrier levels on charter school supply. The researcher's primary find was that incumbent forces in the school market such as the teachers union and school boards pose the greatest constraint on the creation of charter schools.

Bossone, Richard M. and Polishook, Irwin H., eds. 1992. *School Choice: Proceedings of the Fourteenth Conference of the University/Urban Schools National Task Force*. New York: Graduate School and University Center, The City University of New York.

The purpose of these "Proceedings" is to shed light on the subject of school choice by making clear what is meant by school choice, what proposals are being advanced to achieve choice, and what the pros and cons are regarding school choice as viewed by educators, business people, legislators, and lawyers. After a broad overview of the issue is given by Christopher T. Cross, specific examples of school choice are provided by Seymour Fliegel, Tom Triplett, Sally C. Pipes, and David Bennett. Following that, perspective on the pros and cons of choice are given by John Coons, Ralph Flynn, and others.

Boyd, William L. and Walberg, Herbert J. 1990. *Choice in Education*. Berkeley: McCutchan.

This anthology is intended to introduce readers to both the possible benefits and potential problems of school choice. The editors believe that proposals for choice hold exciting potential for both consumers and producers of education. But, like other fundamental reforms, choice threatens the status quo and introduces some unpredictable elements. In Part I, "The Dynamics and Potential of Choice in Education," Chester Finn, Jr., Richard Elmore, and others provide arguments in support of choice plans. In Part II, "Issues and Controversies about Choice," Mary Metz, Moore and Davenport, Joe Nathan and others outline the evidence from some choice programs, the concerns about choice, and the prospects for expansion. The authors believe that in sum, the contents of this book illustrate both the rich potential of choice as well as the challenging issues it raises.

Brown, Byron W. 1997. "Why Governments Run Schools." In *Market Approaches to Education*, Cohn, E., ed. New York: Elsevier: 75-95.

This paper discusses problems of uncertainty and imperfect information that bear on organizational choices for schools. A model of choice under uncertainty illustrates the optimality of the equal opportunity provision of schooling in terms of inputs. The model shows why schools offer similar, diverse curricula as a means of allowing students to shed risk about ability and future employment. Elements of transactions cost economics are used to evaluate organizational choice for providing schooling. Problems of opportunism and regulatory costs are discussed in the cases of for-profit, non-profit, and publicly provided schools.

Brown, Frank, ed. 1991. "School Choice Plans." *Education and Urban Society*, 23, no. 2, (February).

This issue of *Education and Urban Society*, devoted entirely to a discussion of school choice, focuses on a review of what the editor sees as a twin

solution to the problems that plague American schools: 1) deregulation via parental choice of a school for their child, and 2) increased privatization of schooling by making it possible for more children to enroll in private schools. The editor's analysis of the available literature leads him to believe that neither of those actions will improve education for poor and inner-city children. Peter Cookson, Jr., A. Reynaldo Contreras, and Michael Martin are among the authors who contribute articles that support the editor's hypothesis.

Carnoy, Martin. 1996. "Education and Racial Inequality: The Human Capital Explanation Revisited." *Pergamon*, 45, no. 2, pp. 259-71.

Disadvantaged minorities in the United States, such as blacks and Latinos, earn less than whites but have closed the income gap significantly in the past 50 years. Human capital theorists have explained these earnings differences and their decline over time by the relative educational attainment and "quality" of education taken among ethnic/race groups; yet this explanation has been challenged by various views. This paper revisits the controversy with a decade-by decade analysis of changes in black and Latino educational attainment and the "quality" of their education during the period 1940-1990, and how attainment and quality affected black and Latino earnings relative to whites.

Chubb, John E., and Moe, Terry. 1990. *Politics, Markets and the Organization of American Schools*. Washington, D.C.: The Brookings Institution.

The effect of institutions on school effectiveness is explored in this book, which argues that school reforms in the United States are destined to fail because of the failure to address the root of the problem, which is found in the institutions of direct democratic control by which schools have traditionally been governed. Methodology involved analysis of two data sets: High School and Beyond (HSB) survey conducted in 1980 and 1982 and the Administrator and Teacher Survey (ATS) conducted in 1984. The HSB survey elicited responses from 30,030 sophomores in 1980 and 28,240 seniors in 1982 from 532 public and private schools. The ATS survey was administered to 10,370 teachers and 402 principals in a subsample of 402 HBS schools, response rates of 86 and 76 percent, respectively. Findings indicate that schools with effective organizational characteristics perform better; that school autonomy is the most important prerequisite for school effectiveness; and that the existing public education system inhibits the emergence of effective organizations and stifles student achievement. A recommendation is made to implement a new system based on parent/student choice and school competition to promote school autonomy. Six chapters discuss the root of the problem, an institutional perspective on schools, effective school organization, causes of student achievement, institutional context and school organization, and school choice. Notes accompany each chapter. Appendices contain data from the two surveys, measures and indicators, special issues in modeling student achievement, and achievement and organization in public schools.

Clune, William H. and Witte, John F., eds. 1990. *Choice and Control in American Education*. New York: Falmer Press.

Cohn, Elchanan, ed. 1997. *Market Approaches to Education: Vouchers and School Choice*. New York: Elsevier Science Ltd.

This book contains a number of essays that address the recent debate on school choice and vouchers. In addition to papers that provide opinions on the role of government in education, the book offers a number of papers that analyze many of the issues employing advanced econometric techniques. Efforts have been made to balance arguments made by authors including opposing views. Part I, "Theory and Practice of Choice in Education," includes several articles from the *Economics of Education Review*. Part II, "Are Private Schools Superior to Public Schools?" includes articles by Witte, Murnane et al., and Chubb and Moe, among others. Part III, "Empirical Studies of School Choice and Vouchers," includes evaluations of choice programs in Europe, Scotland, Richmond, CA, the Netherlands, and Japan.

Coleman, James S. 1968. "The Concept Of Equality Of Educational Opportunity." *Harvard Educational Review*, 38, pp. 7-22.

In this article, the author traces the evolutionary shifts in interpretation of the concept of equality of educational opportunity, putting into perspective the different views which form the basis for disagreement and indicating how the direction of change may influence the interpretation of this concept in the future.

Coleman, James S., Hoffer, T. and Kilgore, S. 1982. "Achievement And Segregation In Secondary Schools: A Further Look At Public And Private School Differences." *Sociology of Education*, 55, pp. 162-82.

In this article, a response to 6 critical papers written after the publication of the authors' first report in 1981, four areas of empirical results are considered. The greater effectiveness of Catholic schools than public schools; the differential benefit of Catholic schools to students from less advantaged backgrounds; the indications that the higher levels of discipline and academic demands that generally characterize the private schools account in large part for the differences between and sectors' average levels of achievement; and the result that Catholic schools do not have a segregating effect beyond that which already exists in the public schools are all reanalyzed based on the critiques of other researchers. The authors conclude that the results withstand the criticism and warrant closer examination and new data collection.

Coleman, James S. 1992. "Some Points on Choice in Education." *Exchange*, pp. 260-62, (October).

In this article the author points out that the argument against full-scale choice in education, with vouchers for attendance at public or private schools, is based on the failure to recognize two points. First, the current education system is already stratified through selection based on money and race, and so the introduction of choice would only shift the grounds on which

stratification takes place. Second, shifting the basis of stratification from money and race to performance and behavior would introduce appropriate incentives, and the resources to implement these incentives. He believes it is through such incentives that improvement in educational outcomes will take place.

Cookson, Peter W., Jr. 1991. "Private Schooling and Equity: Dilemmas of Choice." *Education and Urban Society*, 23, no. 2, (February), pp. 185-199.

In this article the author asserts that to change the government's policy towards private schools from one of tolerance to one of support would weaken the public sector even more and lead to even greater educational inequality. To argue his point, the author first presents a brief history of private schools in the United States. He then provides a brief overview of private schools today before he goes on to describe the concepts of life arithmetic and the stratification of educational opportunity. He concludes that there is something inherently appealing about encouraging families to choose schools, but the benefits to democracy outweigh the costs in terms of equity.

Cookson, Peter W., Jr., ed. 1992. *The Choice Controversy*. Newbury Park, CA: Corwin Press, Inc.

This anthology of articles on school choice is divided into two parts. Part I, "Democracy, Choice, and Markets," centers on the political and philosophical issues related to school choice in the United States. Mary Anne Raywid and Amy Stuart Wells are among the authors who have contributed articles to this section. Part II, "Private and Public School Choice," provides the reader with a number of alternative ways of examining the school choice issue. John F. Witte and Albert Shanker are among the authors featured in this section. Taken as a whole, this book provides an overview of school choice, yet each chapter can be read as a self-contained discussion. This book is intended for scholars, policymakers, educators, and graduate students who have an interest in the relationship between school choice, society, and educational reform.

Cookson, Peter W., Jr., ed. 1992. "The Choice Controversy: Current Debates and Research." *Educational Policy*, 6, no. 2, (June).

This special issue of *Educational Policy* is devoted to examining the possibilities and problems of school choice through a variety of analytic lenses. The authors writing for this issue approach school choice from the perspective of different disciplines and from differing political and educational orientations. Contributing authors include Mary Anne Raywid, Kevin Dougherty and Lizabeth Sostre, and John Witte.

Cookson, Peter W., Jr. 1994. *School Choice: The Struggle for the Soul of American Education*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

In this book the author discusses the practice and politics of school choice. Cookson outlines the philosophical and historical origins of the school choice movement, examines a variety of school choice plans around the nation, and

analyzes the outcomes of school choice in terms of student achievement, school improvement, and the rights of the citizenry. To illuminate his theories, the author draws on data from programs in Minnesota, Cambridge and Fall River, Massachusetts, East Harlem and White Plains, New York, and Milwaukee, WI.

Coons, John E. and Sugarman, Stephen D. 1979. "A Case for Choice." *California Journal of Teachers Education*, 6, no. 1, (Winter), pp. 1-22.

In this article, the existing educational system and a hypothetical one increasing the authority of families are compared for their relative ability to meet educational objectives. In addition, the authors directly address some of the major reservations raised about the effectiveness of choice as a policy tool.

Darling-Hammond, L., Natarj Kirby, S. and Schlegel, P.M. 1985. *Tuition Tax Deductions and Parent School Choice: A Case Study of Minnesota.* Santa Monica, CA: The RAND Corporation.

This report presents the results of one of the first empirical investigations of how a tax subsidy for tuition costs actually influences parents' school choices. It provides data about subsidy costs, utilization, and effects in Minnesota, the first state to have a tuition subsidy pass judicial review at all levels of the court system. The study also examines the effects of other state aid policies on nonpublic school operations, and it investigates the process by which parents make schooling choices. The study was undertaken to analyze the operation of a tuition tax subsidy within the broader policy context that shapes school choice decisions. The findings suggest that Minnesota's nonpublic school policies may in fact remove some of the obstacles to private school choice, by lowering costs and increasing access for those who might not otherwise be able to choose private schools. However, the tuition tax deduction by itself appears to have little or no effect on parental choice, while it disproportionately benefits parents with higher incomes and educational levels. For those parents at the margin, policies that directly increase access to schooling alternatives (through lower immediate costs and increased convenience) are more likely to affect actual schooling choices than is an indirect tax subsidy.

Education Vouchers: A Report on Financing Elementary Education by Grants to Parents. 1970. (December). Cambridge, MA: The Center for the Study of Public Policy.

This final report commissioned by the U.S. Office of Economic Opportunity outlines the findings of a detailed study of implementation issues surrounding "education vouchers." The report examines a wide variety of possible voucher systems and considers the potential difficulties posed by each. It concludes that some proposed voucher systems are unworkable, that some are unconstitutional, and that many would work against the interests of disadvantaged children. But it also concludes that certain kinds of voucher systems might substantially improve the education of elementary school children, especially the disadvantaged. The conclusions in the report are a result, in part, of an eight month investigation of the feasibility of conducting a demonstration project. Superintendents were contacted regarding their

interest in participating in a demonstration and then community meetings were held in interested cities around the country.

Elmore, Richard F. 1986. *Choice in Public Education.* Washington, D.C.: Center for Policy Research in Education, (December).

In this report the author argues that the existing system of local centralization may indeed create serious problems for the performance and responsiveness of schools, but neither of the two extreme alternatives to the system--private markets or public monopolies--is defensible in theory or in practice. The main points of his analysis are: policies affecting choice must be evaluated from both the demand and supply side, they must take into account the broader public aims of education, and they must acknowledge the wide range of options for enhancing and constraining choice. Finally he says that there is little evidence that greater choice for consumers and providers of education will, by itself, dramatically change the performance of schools. The author concludes by saying that the major argument in favor of experiments with increased choice is that they provide a much-needed prod to a system that is increasingly bureaucratic in its relations with its clients. However, he says, the major problems associated with such experiments are that they may be co-opted by the system they seek to change or that, if they succeed, they may impose the risks of mindless and destructive competitiveness without the benefits of greater attention to quality.

Elmore, Richard F. 1990. "Options for Choice in Public Education." In *Choice in Education*, Boyd, W.L. and Walberg, H.J., eds. Berkeley: McCutchan, 21-42.

In this article the author presents a systematic discussion of the large variety of possible ways of organizing public education. He outlines a wide range of options for enhancing or constraining choice. A key point he makes is that "policies affecting choice must be evaluated from both the demand and supply sides." Thus, "providing consumers with greater educational choice, while at the same time constraining the ability of educators to respond to consumer preferences will only increase dissatisfaction with school."

Fantini, Mario D. 1973. *Public Schools of Choice.* New York: Simon and Schuster.

Final Report: San Antonio School Choice Research Project. 1997. (June). Denton, TX: Center for the Study of Education Reform, University of North Texas.

From 1992 to 1996, the Center for the Study of Education Reform evaluated both a private and public school choice program in San Antonio, Texas. The private program, sponsored by the Children's Educational Opportunity Foundation, provides scholarships to low income parents to enroll their children in private schools. The public program, offered by the San Antonio Independent School District, selects students from across the district to study foreign language and culture.

The report examines: differences between choosing and non-choosing families, differences between private and public school choosers, satisfaction of parents over time, factors involved in student attrition from choice programs, educational impacts of school choice on student achievement, perceptions of teachers, and perceptions of students.

Finn, Chester E., Jr. 1990. "Why We Need Choice." In *Choice in Education*, Boyd, W.L. and Walberg, H.J., eds. Berkeley: McCutchan, 3-19.

The author gives six reasons why we need choice in this article. He says the alternative, no choice, is incompatible with U.S. ideals. Choice, moreover, fosters equality of opportunity; helps parents play their proper role; and stimulates school autonomy, teacher professionalism, and principal leadership. He concludes that choice is a potent mechanism for encouraging greater learning.

Finn, Chester E. Jr., Manno, Bruno V., and Bierlein, Louann A. 1996. "The Empire Strikes Back." *The New Democrat*, (November/December), pp. 8-11.

This article summarizes the findings of a two-year study of charter schools conducted for the Hudson Institute by the authors. The purpose of the study was to analyze the start-up problems encountered by charter schools, consider how they can be solved, and identify policy environments that abate such problems. During the 1995-96 school year, the authors visited 43 charter schools in the twenty-five states that have authorized charter schools. What they found was that the most frequent criticism of charter schools, that they will "cream" the ablest students from the public schools and leave the poor, disabled, and nonwhite students in "regular" schools, is largely a myth. "Far from enrolling the 'best and brightest' or 'richest and whitest,' charter schools are primarily serving kids who were ill-served by the regular schools and failed to thrive therein," state the authors. They found that as many as half of the charter schools in American were founded specifically to serve at-risk students.

They also found that charter school founders face "relentless foes and needless regulations," which they fear will discourage the creation of other innovative schools. In addition, funding woes and opposition from the teachers unions make starting charter schools difficult. They conclude that charter schools, although too new to have produced hard achievement data, have great potential; however, they fear that resistance from the education establishment will prevent the charter school movement from growing big enough and strong enough to demonstrate its full potential.

Fliegel, Seymour, and Macguire, James. 1993. *Miracle in East Harlem*. New York: The Manhattan Institute.

In this book the author, a former deputy superintendent of District Four in East Harlem, tells how a core of dedicated teachers and eager students rescued the local schools from their persistent status as the worst in New York City. Central to East Harlem's transformation was the institution of "choice." Since 1982 students and parents in District Four have actively selected the schools they wish to attend from a pool of alternative programs which are

smaller and more thematically oriented than traditional schools. Those that fail to attract enough students or meet the district's new standards are disbanded and replaced by other programs. Told through the first-hand experiences of Fliegel, the book attempts to make a convincing case for public school choice and to show that if choice can make improvements in East Harlem, it can improve schools anywhere.

Fowler, F.C. 1992. "School Choice Policy in France: Success and Limitations." *Educational Policy*, 6, no. 4, (December), pp. 429-43.

In this article, the author describes the history of school choice policy in France. In 1959, France passed the Debré Act, inaugurating massive subsidies for private education. Under this law, the French government subcontracted secular instruction to those private schools that signed contracts. On the whole, the policy has been successful. It is popular because it provides parents with school choice and has not increase social stratification. However, the policy led to some problems with financial and political accountability. The author concludes that the French experience suggests that carefully conceived regulations are the key to successful choice policies. It also suggests that choice policies may succeed best in environments in which major equity problems have already been solved.

Fuller, Bruce. 1996. "Is School Choice Working." *Educational* Leadership, 54, no. 2, (October), pp. 37-40.

In this summary article of the author's book *Who Chooses, Who Loses?*, the three main questions that the author examined are outlined and his findings are described briefly. Questions regarding which families exit their neighborhood school and exercise choice, what kinds of suppliers choose to enter the supply market, and what effect choice has on student performance are explored. The author concludes that although the evidence on choice is scant, it is clear that choice is an important policy alternative for education in the next several years.

Fuller, Bruce and Elmore, Richard. 1996. *Who Chooses, Who Loses? Culture, Institutions, and the Unequal Effects of School Choice*. New York: Teachers College Press.

This book, the result of a three-year-long seminar series at Harvard University, is a collection of empirical studies evaluating choice programs in Milwaukee, St. Louis, Detroit, and San Antonio. The important issues involved in choice-- such as short- and long-term affects on students, minority student views, vouchers, magnets, and private school programs overseas-- are capsulated and explored. The crucial questions addressed in the collection of studies by researchers like Amy Stuart Wells, Valerie E. Lee, Jeffrey Henig, John F. Witte, Marlaine Lockheed, and Rolf K. Blank, are: Who benefits and who loses under school choice programs? Do innovative forms of schooling flourish? and Does student achievement improve? The concluding chapter, written by Fuller and Elmore, offers four main propositions about educational choice and the policy implications of the empirical research reported in earlier chapters.

Glatter, Ron, Woods, Philip A., and Bagley, Carl. 1997. *Choice and Diversity in Schooling: Perspectives and Prospects.* London: Routledge.

This volume contains the research findings and key themes which emerged from a 1995 seminar hosted by the Open University Centre for Educational Policy and Management. The seminar brought together leading UK scholars, policymakers from central and local government, teachers' unions, and overseas experts. The issues covered include: diversity and hierarchy amongst schools; parental criteria for choosing schools; the differential impact on advantaged and disadvantaged families; national and international variations in educational policies; and rules and practices concerning school admissions.

Geske, Terry G., Davis, Douglas R., and Hingle, Patricia L 1997. "Charter Schools: A Viable Public School Choice Option?" *Pergamon*, 16, no. 1, pp. 15-22.

The charter school movement gained considerable momentum during the early 1990's in the United States. This paper provides an overview of the charter school phenomenon and begins with a consideration of the basic design of these schools. The government's role in education is discussed and various school choice options are identified. The paper then focuses on the degree of overall autonomy granted to charter schools by examining the basic features of various state legislative provisions that permit charter schools. The limited empirical work available is reviewed to present a clearer picture of charter schools with regard to school autonomy and innovation, teacher and student characteristics, and parental contracts and involvement. Several concerns are presented about charter schools relating to autonomy and regulation, market accountability, and at-risk students.

Green, J.P., Peterson, P.E., and Du, J. et al. 1996. "The Effectiveness of School Choice in Milwaukee: A Secondary Analysis of Data from the Program's Evaluation," paper presented before the Panel on the Political Analysis of Urban School Systems at the meeting of the American Political Science Association, San Francisco, CA, August 30.

In 1990 Milwaukee became the site of the first publicly funded school choice program providing low-income parents with vouchers that could be used to send their children to secular, private schools. Milwaukee's school choice experiment was evaluated by a research team headed by political scientist John Witte at the University of Wisconsin. In five annual reports issued between 1991 and 1995, the researchers reported on the effectiveness of the Milwaukee experiment, as measured by the performance of students on standardized mathematics and reading tests. The senior author has summarized the results of his investigation as follow: "This school experiment...(has) not yet led to more effective schools...Choice creates enormous enthusiasm among parents...but student achievement fails to rise."

In February of 1996 the researchers made the data from their evaluation available for secondary analysis on the World Wide Web. This paper is the result of a secondary analysis conducted at the Program in Education Policy and Governance at Harvard University. What these researchers found was attendance at a choice school for three or more years enhances academic

performance as measured by standardized reading and math tests. They also go on to assert that the original research team failed to use appropriate analytical techniques and therefore no valid conclusions can be drawn from the Witte reports.

Guy, Mary Jane. 1992. "The American Common Schools: An Institution at Risk." *Journal of Law and Education*, 21, no. 4, (Fall), pp. 569-99.

In this article, the author argues that the degree and extent of competition in public schools has been debated and discussed for the past century, yet proponents of private "schools choice" have failed to address the unanswered logic of how the outmoded and inefficient institution of the American common school has managed to produce the world's most highly competitive capitalist society. This movement for private school choice along with President Bush's attempt to "break the mold" of the American public school system, recalls a sense of rugged individualism. It suggests the same frontier mentality which has led us to believe that the institutions we create, like the companies and public agencies we operate, are expendable and serve only our own selfish ends as we ride roughshod over the political and social terrain. The voucher is the chosen instrument for dismantling one of America's oldest and most venerable institutions: the American commons school, now itself an institution at risk.

Hakim, Simon, Seidendstat, Paul, and Bowman, Gary W., eds. 1994. *Privatizing Education and Educational Choice: Concepts, Plans, and Experiences*. Westport, CT: Praeger.

In Part I, "Concepts" of this anthology on school choice, the merits of school choice, guidelines for implementation, and types of contracting methods are discussed by David Beers and Jerry Ellig, Tom Feeney, Albert Shanker and Bella Rosenberg, and Paul T. Hill. In Part II, "Alternative Plans," particular plans for implementation are presented by Thomas H. Kean, Peter W. Cookson, Jr., Pierre S. duPont IV, Ernest L. Boyer, and Kevin C. Sontheimer. In Part III, "Experiences," descriptions of choice programs in New Hampshire, Milwaukee, Dade County, Florida, East Harlem, New York, and Minnesota are presented. The editors conclude that the positive externalities associated with education may require some government involvement. However, the basic values of the voucher system still hold true.

Heise, Michael. 1997. "School Choice, Education Policy and Legal Theory: Uncomfortable Yet Inevitable Intersections." *Chicago Policy Review*, 1, no. 2, (Spring).

This article reviews likely intersections between school choice policies and such issues as the United States' Constitution's religion clauses, public regulation of private and religious schools, and school desegregation. By identifying important legal issues implicated by school choice policies, this article seeks to shed light on the complex relationship between courts and education policy in general.

Henig, Jeffrey R. 1994. *Rethinking School Choice: Limits of the Market Metaphor*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

In this book the author traces the evolution of school choice as an idea and in practice. He observes that its legacy is a mixed one. Sometimes it has been a vehicle for racial and economic segregation, with divisive and corrosive effects. The real danger in market-based choice proposals, Henig argues, is not that they might allow some children to attend private schools at the public's expense, but that they tend to crowd out the public forums that must flourish if questions of national policy are to be democratically resolved.

Hill, Paul T., Pierce, Lawrence C., and Guthrie, James W. 1997. *Reinventing Public Education: How Contracting Can Transform America's Schools*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

This book provides, in a hands-on fashion, an explanation of the pros and cons of school contracting and how it would work in practice. The authors describe how using public funds, local school boards could select private providers to operate individual schools under formal contracts specifying the type and quality of instruction. They show how contracting would free local school boards from operating schools so they could focus on improving educational policy; how it would allow parents to choose the best school for their children; and, finally, how it would ensure that schools are held accountable and academic standards are met.

Hill, Paul T. 1996. "The Educational Consequences of Choice." *Phi Delta Kappan*, 77, no. 10, (June), pp. 671-75.

In this article, the author argues that there is ample evidence that universal public school choice would strongly benefit all children, including the disadvantaged, by promoting candid and demanding relationships among teachers, parents, and students. The evidence presented, based primarily on his study of a privately funded voucher program in New York City called the Sponsor Partnership Program, leads the author to conclude that schools of choice are places in which parents and teachers are collaborators, bargains among adults and between adults and children are made and kept, effort is rewarded, and actions have consistent consequences. Such environments, he believes, motivate student effort in the short run and socialize students into values required in adulthood in the long run.

James, Thomas and Levin, Henry M., eds. 1983. *Public Dollars for Private Schools: The Case of Tuition Tax Credits*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

This anthology of articles related to the issue of public support for non-public schools focuses on the case of tuition tax credits. The first section is devoted to examining the relationship between the public and private sectors in education. In this section, Levin offers an introductory essay which examines the tension between choice and equity within the historical tradition of common schooling. In the second section, issues of cost, constitutional aspects, and of equity are examined by Nathan Glazer, David Breneman, and others. The third section addresses several analytical questions about the claims made by both advocates and opponents of tax credits. Richard

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Murnane offers an essay on how tax credits might affect student sorting, J. Douglas Willms presents his findings from a quantitative analysis of national data on private and public school performance, and several economists present consumer choice models which might predict how enrollment patterns and school funding would change under a tuition tax credit system.

Kearney, Philip C. and Arnold, Michael L. 1994. "Market Driven Schools and Educational Choices." *Theory Into Practice*, 33, no. 2, (Spring), pp. 112-17.

In this article the authors explore what is meant by the terms *market driven schools* and *educational choices* by attempting to sort out some of the issues surrounding each concept and by providing a framework for more thoughtful consideration and evaluation of the likely consequences of the myriad policy proposals being advanced at the state and national levels. They define market driven schools as being characterized by ,"a tight connection between organizational performance and the continuing flow of resources." They then go on to define educational choice as giving parents and other citizens power to choose the type of schooling that will be provided to students. Finally, they focus on the validity of the claims made by choice proponents, such as: will choice increase academic achievement? what are the secondary effects of choice schools? is choice a valued end in itself? and what are the social equity issues raised by choice? They conclude that there is a lack of ex post arguments to support the claims of choice advocates; however, if used responsibly, choice might prove to be a lever for positive change.

Krashinsky, Michael. 1986. "Why Educational Vouchers May Be Bad Economics." *Teachers College Record*, 88, no. 2, (Winter), pp. 163-68.

In this article, the author takes a different approach to the voucher controversy by claiming that the rejection of vouchers does not have to be a rejection of basic economics. Rather, the author believes that arguments against vouchers can be based in a well-developed economic literature that predicts when organizations will choose to produce what they want themselves (make it) and when they will contract out for its production (buy it.) He asserts that government produces education itself because that is the cheapest way to ensure that the right level of public benefit is produced in the schools. In the context of his theory, the author summarizes the arguments for and against educational vouchers, describes some of the literature on how organizations decide whether to produce a commodity themselves or contract for it in the market, and concludes by asserting that the arguments he presents can be applied to other public sectors under pressure to privatize production.

Lee, Valerie E. 1995. "San Antonio School Choice Plans: Rewarding or Creaming?" *Social Science Quarterly*, 76, no. 3, (September), pp. 513-21.

In this response to the Martinez et al. study of the San Antonio public and private voucher programs, the author asserts that the Martinez research along with the results of Witte's Milwaukee findings, the results of the Alum Rock experiment, and the evidence from the St. Louis interdistrict transfer

program all provide stable and sturdy evidence on who chooses and why. She says the evidence shows that families who are best positioned to take advantage of options that might benefit their children, and those who have the highest motivations and most reasonable values toward such actions, will do so. The remainder of her response focuses on what researchers *didn't* learn in their studies. She believes that researchers have omitted important questions from their researcher such as: what are the characteristics of choice schools? what are the goals of the programs? how is information on programs disseminated? what are the competing theory of choice? and how will technical issues such as scoring of composites and low response rates be resolved. She concludes by saying that school choice is a social policy which actually exacerbates social and economic distance among America's citizens instead of being a catalyst for change in public schools.

Levin, Henry M. 1983. "Educational Choice And The Pains Of Democracy." In *Public Dollars for Private Schools*, T. James and H.M. Levin, eds. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 17-38.

The purpose of this chapter is to inquire more deeply into the nature of choice in education and the consequences of different choice arrangements to better understand initiatives like tuition tax credits and vouchers. First, the author identifies the tensions between choice and common schooling in a democratic society. Second, he demonstrates the connection between the restriction of differences in the public schools and the increasing pressure for private alternatives. Third, he argues that the range of choice mechanisms is more extensive than just those associated with tax credits and vouchers. His conclusion is that the challenge to expand educational choice must be reconciled with the democratic purposes of schooling in American society.

Levin, Henry M. 1989. "Mapping the Economics of Education: An Introductory Essay." *Educational Researcher*, (May), pp. 13-16.

In this essay, Levin argues that economic analysis is often missing from research on how to improve the education system in the United States. He points out that school choice proposals like tuition tax credits, educational vouchers, and school choice more generally have an indispensable, but neglected basis in economic concepts. He then goes on to briefly explain the history of the economics of education and highlights some of the more important research that has been conducted in the field by Eric Hanushek and others.

Levin, Henry M. and Kelley, Carolyn. 1994. "Can Education Do It Alone?" *Pergamon*, 13, no. 2, pp. 97-108.

Public policy in the last decade has placed great expectations on education to energize the economy by producing a workforce with higher test scores and greater educational attainments. This paper argues that education requires a range of complementary conditions in order to provide a payoff and cannot to the job by itself. This argument is also extended to research which extrapolates longitudinal consequences of educational investments from cross-sectional studies of the relation between education and various economic and social outcomes. It is argued that this research also overstates

the effects of education by not considering the complementary conditions that must be in place to realize the relation that is embedded in cross-sectional data.

Levy, Daniel C. 1986. *Private Education: Studies in Choice and Public Policy*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Private education and comparisons between private and public education at the collegiate and elementary/secondary levels are discussed in 11 articles. Attention is directed to relationships between private choice and public policy as they affect the quality, finance, governance, mission, and division of labor in a cross-national, interdisciplinary context. Titles and authors are as follows: "Private Choice and Public Policy in Nonprofit Education" (Daniel C. Levy); "Public Policy toward Private Schools: A Focus on Parental Choice" (Mary-Michelle Upson Hirschoff); "Federal Policies for Private Schools" (Mark A. Kutner, Joel D. Sherman, Mary F. Williams); "Choice and Private Schools: Dynamics of Supply and Demand" (Donald A. Erickson); "Public Subsidies for Private and Public Education: The Dutch Case" (Estelle James); "Comparisons of Private and Public Schools: The Critical Role of Regulations" (Richard J. Murnane); "Comparisons of Private and Public Schools: What Can We Learn?" (R. Murnane); "'Private' and 'Public:' Analysis amid Ambiguity in Higher Education" (D. Levy); "Alternative Private-Public Blends in Higher Education Finance: International Patterns" (D. Levy); "Finance and Function: Voluntary Support and Diversity in American Private Higher Education" (Roger L. Geiger); and "Cross-Subsidization in Higher Education: Does It Pervert Private Choice and Public Policy?" (E. James).

Manley-Casimir, Michael E., ed. 1982. *Family Choice in Schooling*. Lexington, MA: LexingtonBooks.

This collection of original papers were originally produced for a symposium held in May 1980 entitled "Family Choice, Schooling, and the Public Interest," sponsored by the Faculty of Education at Simon Fraser University and the British Columbia Council for Leadership in Educational Administration. The first four chapters furnish a comparative perspective on the family choice issue- drawn for Canada by J. Donald Wilson and Marvin Lazerson and for the United States by Stephen Arons, Joel Spring, and William Ball. Subsequent chapters examine the central philosophical aspects of the debate, report studies of choice behavior, and examine the advantages and disadvantages of tax credits as opposed to vouchers. Contributing authors in these sections include William Garner and Jane Hannaway, Richard Nault and Susan Uchitelle, John Coons and Stephen Sugarman, and E.G. West.

Martinez, Valerie, et. al. 1996. "Public School Choice in San Antonio: Who Chooses and with What Effects?" In *Who Chooses, Who Loses? Culture, Institutions, and the Unequal Effects of School Choice*, Bruce Fuller and Richard Elmore, eds. New York : Teachers College Press, pp. 50-69.

This study focuses on two middle schools which house the San Antonio Independent School District multilingual thematic programs at the middle grade level. Both school are in inner-city neighborhoods, and about half of each school's enrollment consists of multilingual-program students from

around the district. The evaluation focuses on answering three questions: Which families choose to participate in the choice program and why do they leave their neighborhood schools? What impact does the multilingual program have on student achievement? and What impact does the program have on parental satisfaction? The results presented by the researchers are based on data collected during the first two years of a three-year study. The researchers concluded, among other things, that student test scores are the most important predictor of program admittance as the admissions process is selective due to a limited number of spaces available. They also concluded that parental education- especially of the mother- in combination with parental aspirations for their children's education also are important predictors of which parents will choose. Finally, they concluded that both coming from a choosing family and going to a choice school have a significant impact on academic performance of students.

Matland, Richard E. 1995. "Exit, Voice, Loyalty, and Neglect in an Urban School System." *Social Science Quarterly*, 76, no. 3, (September), pp. 506-11.

In this response to the paper by Martinez, et al. on the San Antonio private voucher program, the author comments on the Children's Educational Opportunity (CEO) Foundation program and what the study concludes about the private choice programs' abilities to serve as effective mechanisms for turning around declining schools. Using Hirschman's exit, voice, and loyalty model, the author analyzes whether or not declining urban schools are sensitive to the exit option. The author concludes that school choice programs create less than 1% exit from public schools, and that voucher programs only help the families of students already enrolled in private schools.

McArthur, E., Colopy, K.W. and Schlaline, B. 1995. *Use of School Choice*. Education Policy Issues: Statistical Perspectives. NCES 95-742R. Washington, D.C.: National Center for Education Statistics, US Department of Education.

This two-page report published as a part of the NCES Education series is designed to provide the best statistical information available on school choice. Based on the results of the National Household Education Survey 1993 (NHES:93), the characteristics of families who choose schools is given. The results also include parents' primary reasons for choosing a school. Four important findings are outlined: 1) in 1993, almost 1/5 of children attended schools other than their assigned school, 2) black students were more likely than white students to attend a chosen school, 3) the primary reason cited by parents for selecting the school attended by their child was academic, and 4) overall, 80 percent of parents had a positive perception of the schools their children attended.

McKinney, Joseph R. 1996. "Charter Schools: A New Barrier for Children with Disabilities." *Educational Leadership*, 54, no. 2, (October), pp. 22-25.

Using evidence from Arizona and national charter school surveys, the author concludes that charter schools serve children with disabilities at a lower rate than traditional schools. He attributes this fact, in part, to whether or not a charter school is considered a part of the regular district, or a legally

autonomous school district. He recommends that in states where charters are separate school districts, charter schools must strike cooperative arrangements with school districts. He also recommends that states must monitor charter schools to ensure compliance with the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act.

Meier, Deborah W. 1995. *The Power of Their Ideas: Lessons for America from a Small School in Harlem.* Boston: Beacon Press Boston.

At Central Park East (CPE) schools in East Harlem, New York City, 90 percent of students graduate from high school and 90 percent of those go on to college. Starting with the CPE success story, this book shows why good education is possible for all children, and why public education is vital to the future of our democracy. Begun in the mid-1970s, CPE is now four public schools serving primarily Latino and African American students, most from low-income families. Rooted in the traditions of progressive education, CPE has focused on: (1) building democratic community, both giving decision-making power to school staff and preparing students for full citizenship; (2) promoting strong respectful relationships with families and the local community; (3) fostering "habits of the mind," rigorous critical inquiry that challenges students' curiosity and builds on their natural drive toward competence; (4) integrating the curriculum and teaching fewer subjects in depth rather than more subjects superficially; and (5) connecting learning to the real world.

The innovations undertaken at CPE were made possible by school choice mechanisms (parents chose to send their children to CPE) and by the schools' small size. Small size (defined as a maximum of 20 teachers, with a maximum class size of 20) allows staff to be personally involved in all school decisions, to know about each other's work, and to know their students' work and ways of thinking; fosters physical safety and accountability; and immerses students in a school culture shaped by adults. By engaging teachers, small schools stand a chance of engaging students, too, and helping them become lifelong learners and actively participating citizens of a free society.

Moe, Terry M., ed. 1995. *Private Vouchers.* Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press.

This book offers the firsthand observations of research teams in Indianapolis, Milwaukee, San Antonio, and New York City who studied four of the largest, best-established private voucher programs in the nation. With detailed analyses of how such programs actually operate, these accounts shed constructive light on a wide range of issues central to the voucher debate, particularly those that bear on social equity and the effects of vouchers on disadvantaged populations. Using evaluation techniques developed by John Witte for the Milwaukee public voucher program, the researchers in the three Golden Rule-type programs in Indianapolis, Milwaukee, and San Antonio found that the participating students and the private schools they chose to attend were more diverse than the public voucher program. They also found that, on the issue of skimming, the Golden Rule-type programs tend to attract parents who are somewhat more likely to be white, married, and have fewer children than other low-income families, and they tend to be much better educated than their non-choosing cohorts. In addition, researchers found that overwhelmingly parents reported that academic quality was their most salient

reason for participating, that participating parents are more satisfied, and the academic achievement of the students in the New York City program, the oldest program in the group, is much better than public school students measured by graduation rates and college attendance rates.

Moore, Donald R. and Davenport, Suzanne. 1990. "School Choice: The New Improved Sorting Machine." In *Choice in Education*, Boyd, W.L. and Walberg, H.J., eds. Berkeley: McCutchan, 187-223.

In this article, the authors report on the implementation of choice plans in Boston, Chicago, New York, and Philadelphia. They find that black, Hispanic, and low-income students and those with special learning problems and limited English proficiency tend to be further concentrated and excluded from some programs. Although they believe some of these problems may be attributable to flaws of design and implementation, the authors are not sanguine that choice can provide an effective solution to the problems that beset urban schools.

Murnane, Richard J. 1986. "Family Choice in Public Education: The Roles of Students, Teachers, and System Designers." *Teachers College Record*, 88, no. 2, (Winter), pp. 169-89.

In this article, the author attempts to inform the choice debate by exploring the merits and limitations of expanding family choice of education for children. He examines how such choice affects students and teachers, what are the competing objectives, and what regulates the choices families may make. Complementing an article by Kranshinsky in the same issue, in which the author analyzes why governments may want to "make" education instead of "buying" it, Murnane explores whether greater family choice among public school alternatives can improve the quality of education. He concludes that artfully designed public school choice programs can improve the quality of education for some children, including low-income children, but will not improve education for all children. However, he cautions that the consequences of family choice for students and teachers depend critically on the specifics of the regulations that define the plan.

Nathan, Joe and Ysseldyke, James. 1994. "What Minnesota Has Learned About School Choice." *Phi Delta Kappan*, 75, no. 9, (May), pp. 682-88.

Minnesotans have avoided the rhetoric of "panacea or plague" that has been a feature of discussions of school choice in many parts of the country. In this article, Nathan and Ysseldyke share comprehensive research and individual stories to illustrate what has been learned from choice programs in that state.

Ogawa, Rodney T., Dutton, Jo Sargent. 1994. "Parental Choice in Education: Examining the Underlying Assumptions." *Urban Education*, 29, no. 3, (October), pp. 270-97.

In this article, the authors describe four prominent forms of parental choice that have been proposed as broad policy tools to improve education, identify assumptions underlying these initiatives, and review the findings of research that bear on these assumptions. Although the evidence is generally

incomplete and inconclusive, it sheds more light on the type of parents who are most likely to exercise choice: They tend to be better educated and already involved in their children's education. The general lack of evidence leads us to two observations: (a) the current debate over choice may center less on the question of its ability to improve education and more on the question of whose interests are served by education, and (b) the failure of researchers to examine nonchoosing parents may have eliminated an important perspective from the discussion on choice as an educational policy tool.

Payne, Rebecca S. 1993. "Poverty Limits School Choice in Urban Settings." *Urban Education*, 28, no. 3, (October), pp. 281-99.

Choice plans abound and are touted to be the panacea for the major ills of education. This article, although not arguing against choice as a reform option, presents the position that there are circumstances in poverty settings that will continue to further disenfranchise segments of our society from education even with choice. These segments of society, because of their limited productivity, are costly to sustain. Their circumstances limit the prerequisites for high-quality school choice by parents, and if left unconsidered will result in even worse conditions in urban schools. Recommendations are suggested based on successful programs in these settings.

Pearson, Judith. 1993. *Myths of Educational Choice*. Westport, CT: Praeger.

This book, written by a school teacher from Minnesota, is intended to construct a few speed bumps in the path of the accelerating bandwagon of school choice. The author believes that poorly conceived, hastily enacted programs of enrollment choice in education may do more harm than good. The potential problems she outlines are lost opportunities for children, weakened communities in rural America, and a significant erosion of the basic structure of our democratic society. She provides evidence for her concerns from her experiences and data collected from Minnesota, and from her analysis of the data from the Milwaukee choice programs. She concludes that the questions she raises urge caution and further study before risking choice as a panacea for the problems in American education.

Plank, Stephen et al. 1993. "Effects of Choice in Education." In *School Choice: Examining the Evidence*, Rasell, Edith and Rothstein, Richard, eds. Washington. D.C.: Economic Policy Institute.

The purpose of this paper is to examine some of the different reforms that are meant by choice and the variety of mechanisms or paths through which reforms in this direction might have their effect. Using data from the National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988, several important insights about which students exercise school choice in the public and private sectors and what effect choice is having on their performance, attitudes, and educational plans is presented. Generally, the researchers found that students who are educationally disadvantaged are most likely to enroll in public schools of choice. Also, these students have slightly lower eighth grade achievement levels, but this may have something to do with the typical location of magnet

programs and vocational schools. Finally, they find that magnet and vocational-technical schools have not been successful in creating a more integrated environment.

Public Schools of Choice: ASCD Issues Analysis. 1990. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Research and past and current examples of choice are discussed in this analysis of public schools of choice. The authors believe that there appear to be no definitive answers in the choice literature, and that choice alone is not a sufficient solution to revitalize schools. The authors advocate addressing choice within the broad objectives of public education- balancing the private good with the public good- and responding to needs by using uncommon means to achieve common ends. The authors intend this report to be used as a guide by educators when discussing their own hopes and fears about choice.

Randall, Ruth, and Geiger, Keith. 1991. *School Choice: Issues and Answers*. Bloomington, IN: National Education Service.

This book attempts to provide a balanced presentation of choice and its many attending issues. In Chapter One, Randall, former Minnesota Commissioner of Education, describes her rationale for supporting choice. In Chapter Two, Geiger, then President of the National Education Association, expresses his reservations about choice including that it may be used instead of adequately funding schools. Chapter Three provides a summary of choice issues addressed in legislation in Arkansas, Idaho, Iowa, Minnesota, Nebraska, Ohio, Utah, and Washington. The results of a case study of choice for parents and students in Minnesota are reported in Chapter Four. Finally, Chapter Five highlights the major challenges facing successful school choice.

Rasell, Edith and Rothstein, Richard, eds. 1993. *School Choice: Examining the Evidence*. Washington, D.C.: Economic Policy Institute.

This volume is the result of a seminar series on school choice hosted by researchers at the Economic Policy Institute. The seminar participants identified three key education issues which were also major areas of disagreement among choice advocates and opponents. They are: the effects of school choice on the educational, racial, and economic integration of students- does school choice promote equality of opportunity? the effects of school choice on schools' academic effectiveness- does school choice raise student achievement? and the relationship between choice and school system reform- is choice the way to reform American schools?

Amy Stuart Wells, Frank Echols and Douglas Willms, Mary Driscoll, and John Witte all contribute articles which address the issue of whether or not parents' and students' choices will drive school reform. Wells, Witte, Robert Crain, and Plank, et al. present research that addresses issues of the effects of school choice on the socioeconomic and racial integration of students. St. Louis, New York City and Milwaukee studies are presented. Finally, Plank, Kathryn Schiller, Barbara Schneider, James Coleman, and Peter Cookson contribute papers addressing the issue of choice and improvements in student academic achievement. A reanalysis of Chubb and Moe's analysis is provided.

Several of the discussants conclude that although choice is not a panacea for reform, it could support other reform efforts by enhancing parental satisfaction with schools and helping to guide school improvement efforts.

Raywid, Mary Anne. 1992. "Choice Orientations, Discussions, and Prospects." *Educational Policy*, 6, no. 2, (June), pp. 105-22.

This article presents an examination of the contemporary choice discussion which yields four somewhat distinct choice orientations and cases: an education-driven argument for choice; an economics-driven argument; a government-driven argument; and an argument from particular national policy concerns of the past several decades. Each of these cases is sketched. Some logical and other features of the choice discussion are noted, and finally some predictions are offered about the likely course of the choice discussion over the next several years.

Roggeveen, Dirk G. 1993. "Choice for America's Poor." *Momentum*, 24, no. 4, (November/December), pp. 26-8.

In this article the author asserts that school choice would allow disadvantaged children access to the education that they and their families desire. He argues that few misfortunes afflicting the average American child are as unnecessary as having to attend poorly performing public schools. Using statistics from the Los Angeles Unified Schoo District and the Chicago Public Schools, he argues that large urban schools are failing to educate poor children, and that private schools in the same neighborhoods that offer scholarships to poor students provide a much superior education. He concludes that public, private, and parochial school choice would not only enable poor parents to seek out quality education for their children, but would also lead to the expansion of such opportunities.

Schneider, Mark, et al. 1997. "Institutional Arrangements and the Creation of Social Capital: The Effects of Public School Choice." *American Political Science Review*, 91, no. 1, (March), pp. 82-93.

While the possible decline in the level of social capital in the United States has received considerable attention by scholars such as Putnam and Fukuyama, less attention has been paid to the local activities of citizens that help define a nation's stock of social capital. Scholars have paid even less attention to how institutional arrangements affect levels of social capital. In this article, the authors argue that giving parents greater choice over the public schools their children attend creates incentives for parents as "citizen/consumers" to engage in activities that build social capital. Their empirical analysis employs a quasi-experimental approach comparing parental behavior in two pairs of demographically similar school districts in New York and New Jersey that vary on the degree of parental choice over the schools their children attend. Their data show that, controlling for many other factors, parents who choose when given the opportunity are higher on all the indicators of social capital analyzed. The authors conclude that the design of government institutions can create incentives for individuals to engage in activities that increase social capital.

School Choice. 1992. Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching. Princeton, NJ: Carnegie Foundation.

Based on field research, on national surveys of chief state school officers, and on interviews with parents, students, teachers, and administrators, this report examines the effectiveness of three forms of "school choice", districtwide, statewide, and private-school choice, and provides guidelines for the successful operation of public school "choice" programs. It offers a strategy for educational renewal that blends the neighborhood school tradition with new options and explores how the issue of school choice relates to the nation's commitment to public education. Appendices contain tables drawn from the national surveys, and a state-by-state summary of the Survey of Chief State School Officers, 1992.

"Schools of Choice?" 1990/91. *Educational Leadership*, 48, no. 4, (December/January), pp. 4-66.

The articles contained in this issue of *Educational Leadership* are written by both supporters and critics of school choice who all agree that choice itself is not a panacea as some advocates claim. The articles by researchers like Mary Anne Raywid, Richard Elmore, Charles Glenn, John Coons and Stephen Sugarman, among others, focus on local examples of how choice works in practice. The editor concludes that the important question educational leaders must ask themselves is whether, in a system striving to promote, "the full set of conditions that promote excellence," (ASCD Panel 1990, p. 32), schools should be encouraged to differ from one another, and parents should be able to choose among them. The editor believes they should.

Smith, Kevin B. and Meier, Kenneth J. 1995. *The Case Against School Choice*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, Inc.

In this book, Professors Smith and Meier argue that the promise of a choice-based system is largely unfulfilled. Despite the rhetoric, they believe, the successes of existing choice systems are questionable, and the theories and assumptions that provide intellectual support for choice have never been systematically tested. They attempt to show that a choice-based system will not improve American education by proving that choice theorists have exaggerated the decline in educational performance and have misidentified its causes, have created a market cure modeled on unfounded assumptions, and have created an argument for choice which is demonstrably false and misleading. By using individual case stories of students in Milwaukee, and reinterpreting data from Chubb and Moe, Witte, Lee, and others, they attempt to prove that school choice is likely to promote racial, religious, and socio-economic segregation.

Tannenbaum, Margaret, ed. 1995. *Concepts and Issues in School Choice*. Lampeter, Dyfed, Wales: Edwin Mellen Press, Ltd.

In one of the most complete anthologies of the work of school choice researchers and academics published recently, choice proposals that have emerged during the ongoing struggle are examined from a historical

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

perspective. The articles include not only an examination of the changing social and political agendas that affected the views of those most involved in the choice debate, but also an effort to understand the unique aspects of our society that makes this a major question.

This volume presents articles which best capture the voices of the 1960's, 70's, and 80's as they try to articulate their visions of what is the best balance between the parent and the state in the control of children's schooling. In Section I, "Vouchers," articles by choice scholars such as Milton Friedman, Christopher Jencks, John Coons, Albert Shanker, and Linda Darling-Hammond are including. In Section II, "Magnet Schools," Deborah Meier, Frank Esposito, and Christine H. Rossell are among the contributing authors. Section III, "Schools of Choice," includes work by Chester Finn, Jr., John Chubb, Mary Anne Raywid, James Coleman, Ted Kolderie, Joe Nathan and others. Finally, in Section IV, "A New Form of Schooling," the editor concludes with a discussion of choice and accountability issues.

Thernstrom, Abigail. 1991. *School Choice in Massachusetts.* Boston, MA: Pioneer Institute for Public Policy Research.

In her study of school choice in Massachusetts, Dr. Thernstrom analyzes the issues surrounding choice, whether "controlled" or "true". The basic premise of her study is that the most important consideration for urban youth is not integration, but quality education, and that we ought to move ahead with a program of true choice within urban districts where parental choice is now modified by numerous restrictive court rulings regarding desegregation.

Tyack, David B. 1993. "Constructing Difference: Historical Reflections on Schooling and Social Diversity." *Teachers College Record*, 95, no. 1, (Fall), pp. 8-34.

Issues of social diversity have polarized the politics of education during the last generation. The United States has never been so diverse, it seems, and the challenges facing the schools appear unprecedented. In this article, the author probes the comparative histories of social constructions of "gender", "race", and "ethnicity" and the educational policies linked to these conceptions of diversity. These comparisons can illuminate the degree to which boundaries between different kinds of groups are porous and can suggest ways in which individuals may experience multiple identities in different social settings.

The author concludes that students need to learn to criticize and erode the cultural constructions of difference that stratify people into unequal groups. This kind of education requires a moral courage and depth of intellectual probing that is too rarely found today. Public education falls far short if it takes monocultural or timidly "pluralistic" approach to preparing students for the multicultural society of the twenty-first century.

Tyack, David B. and James, Thomas. 1985. "Moral Majorities and the School Curriculum: Historical Perspectives on the Legalization of Virtue." *Teachers College Record*, 86, no. 4, (Summer), pp. 513-37.

For over a century, state government has been in the classroom, mandating the values that inform the curriculum. From the last quarter of the nineteenth century onward, and especially during the two decades surrounding World War I, groups claiming to be moral majorities prevailed on state legislators to enact into law their own conceptions of what should be taught as moral certainty.

This article details the legal history of state mandated values in public education and argues that these mandates, which in many cases have been upheld by the courts, are at odds with parental rights to choose a value-set for their children.

Viadero, Debra. 1995. "A School of Choice." *Education Week*, 15, no. 10, (November 8), pp. 31-33.

In this review of *Who Chooses, Who Loses? Culture, Institutions, and the Unequal Effects of School Choice*, Fuller and Elmore, eds., the author interviews several of the researchers whose studies are included in the anthology. Joe Nathan, John Witte, Amy Stuart Wells, Terry Moe, Mary Anne Raywid, and Bruce Fuller are all quoted on their view of the purpose and effectiveness of the book.

Walford, Geoffrey. 1994. *Choice and Equity in Education*. London: Cassell.

This book looks at the key issue of choice and equity in education. Basing his views on extensive research, the author looks at the history of choice in education, and in particular at two schemes in the UK- assisted places and city technology colleges- which were promoted to increase parental choice in schools. He investigates the atmosphere of choice in the wake of the 1988 Education Reform Act and asks whether this legislation really increased choice. The book also considers the continuing effect of social class on the level of choice available and taken.

In order to provide a comparison with the British system, the book also examines the debate in the US, looking at the magnet schools program and the choice experiment in Boston, where all parents are forced to choose schools.

Wells, Amy S. 1991. "Choice in Education: Examining the Evidence on Equity." *Teachers College Record*, 39, pp. 138-55.

In this article, the first in a series published as a symposium on "Politics, Markets, and America's Schools," the author provides a critical analysis of Chubb and Moe's central thesis based on her concerns about how vouchers will affect issues of equity. After providing a brief history of school choice and its impact on race and class, she then reviews some of the early evidence on vouchers and equity from the Alum Rock, California choice experiment which began in 1972 and ended in 1977. She concludes that the evidence from the Alum Rock experiment coupled with the history of choice and desegregation policies raise important questions about how parents and students make educational decisions. She says these questions leave an essential "supply-side" school choice question unanswered: can a deregulated, competitive system of free market provide the impetus for educators to

assure that all (or at least most) children are served better? Her introductory essay is followed by a critique of Chubb and Moe's thesis written by Peter W. Cookson, Jr. Following the Cookson review, Chubb and Moe respond to the criticisms of their work in an article entitled, "Political Pollyannas." The collection of articles concludes with a piece by Harold Howe II entitled, "Thoughts on Choice," in which he questions the assumption that *any* school reform measure can fix the schools so that the schools can fix the children, no matter how much children are damaged in families and communities that do not serve their needs.

Wells, Amy S. 1993. *Time To Choose*. New York: Hill and Wang.

This book examines various school choice alternatives and the educational philosophies underlying them, as well as providing an overview of the history of alternative education programs in the United States. An attempt is made to dispel the notion that all school choice plans are created equal and to show that, depending on the goals, some plans are better than others. Chapters discuss the original school choice movement, school desegregation by choice, statewide school choice plans for the 1990s, tuition voucher plans and equity issues, and the constitutional issues surrounding voucher plans and the separation of church and state.

Whitty, Geoff. 1996. "Creating Quasi-Markets in Education: A Review of Recent Research on Parental Choice and School Autonomy in Three Countries." *Review of Research in Education*, 22, (Fall), pp. 3-47.

This article reviews recent research literature concerning the progress and effects of the currently fashionable "parental choice" and "school autonomy" agendas in contemporary education policy. In discussing *parental choice*, the article examines policies that claim to enhance opportunities for choice among public schools and those that use public funds to extend choice into the private sector. *School autonomy*, as used here, refers to the moves to individual public schools, whether to site-based professionals, community-based councils, or a combination of both. Advocates of both sets of policies argue that they will enhance the efficiency, effectiveness, and responsiveness of the education system as a whole.

Witte, John F. 1995. "Three Critical Factors in the School Choice Debate." *Social Science Quarterly*, 76, no. 3, (September), pp. 503-5.

In this response to a paper published by Martinez, Godwin, Kemerer, and Perna on the San Antonio school choice programs the author outlines three results which he considers crucial to the broad-based educational voucher debate. The issues he addresses were stimulated by either the findings or omissions of the Martinez report. The three issues are: 1) the importance of religion in private school selection, 2) the critical importance of "switching" between public and private schools, and 3) the need to focus research on school selection effects. He concludes by saying that the results of the Martinez study raise questions concerning the shift from modest choice programs to broader voucher systems.

Witte, John F. and Thorn, Christopher A. 1996. "Who Chooses? Voucher and Interdistrict Choice Programs in Milwaukee." *American Journal of Education*, 104, (May), pp. 186-217.

This article analyzes two types of choice programs located in the Milwaukee metropolitan area. Numerous research issues are involved in the debates over educational choice. Two of the most important sets of issues are who chooses and why, and what are the effects on educational outcomes? This article is concerned with the first set of questions. The theme of the article is that who chooses is a function of the type and design of the choice program itself. Although there are some similarities in the characteristics of students and families in the Milwaukee Parental Choice program (a private-school voucher program) and the Chapter 220 program (an inter-district public-school choice program), the contrasts are sharp and consistent across key variables. That result may not be welcomed by those seeking simple and decisive conclusions concerning some general theory of educational choice. The authors, however, view it somewhat positively because the message is that policymakers have the ability to create different choice programs to address the different problems with appropriate effects on diverse student populations.

Witte, John F. 1996. *School Choice and Student Performance in Public Schools*. Prepared for delivery at the First Edwin J. O'Leary Symposium on Financial Management. University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, (October).

This paper focuses on four public school choice options and what researchers do and do not know about their effects on student performance. The author gives a detailed account of the development of school choice as a policy alternative, and then spends the remainder of the paper focusing on the performance data available on four categories of choice: magnet schools, inter-district choice programs, open enrollment programs, and charter schools. He concludes that public-school choice is a major reform movement today, even more than private-school choice, however the effects on achievement are somewhat thin. Students in choice schools seem to do better on standardized achievement tests. However, unmeasured selectivity by choice schools in some studies is a problem in estimating performance. He recommends that before choice options are expanded, especially in troubled, large urban districts, more attention needs to be paid to the selection effects of various programs, and outcome effects need to be documented.

Wohlstetter, Priscilla, and Anderson, Lesley. 1994. "What Can U.S. Charter Schools Learn from England's Grant-Maintained Schools?" *Phi Delta Kappan*, 75, no. 6, (February), pp. 486-91.

In this article, the authors examine the early experiences of grant-maintained schools in Britain and consider some of the challenges that face self-governing schools in both the U.S. and the United Kingdom during the 1990's. They identify several components of the British grant program that they believe contribute to the success of such schools, including: the provision of start-up resources, assistance from outside consultants, prior

experience with school-based management, and expansion of management staff at the school site. They also identify several challenges that American charter schools can expect to encounter including: division of responsibility, economies of scale, rethinking the organization of the school, and monitoring increasing numbers of charter schools.

Young, T.W. and Clinchy, E. 1992. *Choice in Public Education.* New York: Teachers College Press.

In this book, the authors attempt to move the debate on school choice from theory to application and hope to contribute a useful book for parents and school professionals who might want to implement choice in their schools, districts, or states. In order to do that, the authors first review the research on public school choice to identify effective and ineffective options and plans currently in practice. They then provide the results of their case studies of three school districts in Massachusetts, New Jersey, and California that have implemented district-wide choice programs with varying degrees of success. The authors conclude that choice is *the* catalyst for significant and positive educational change, and that through the adoption of choice and the structural changes that accompany it, public education can have a bright and powerful future.